## RECEIVED CENTRAL FAX CENTER

No. 2658 P. 1

#### JUN 1 2 2006



FAX TRANSMITTAL SHEET

Motorola, Inc.

Law Department – MD 1610 8000 W. Sunrise Blvd. Plantation, FL 33322

Telephone: (954) 723-6449 Fax: (954) 723-3871

32

Number of Pages (including this page)

Date:

June 12, 2006

To Examiner:

Phuong, Dai

Location:

United States Patent and Trademark Office

Fax No.:

Centralized Fax Number: 1 (571) 273-8300

From:

Larry G. Brown - Registration No. 45,834

Attorney's Docket No.

CE12083JME – Robertson, Jr., et al.

Confirmation No. 3837

NOTICE: This facsimile transmission may contain information that is confidential, privileged, or exempt from disclosure under applicable law. It is intended only for the person to whom it is addressed. Unauthorized use, disclosure, copying or distribution may expose you to legal liability. If you have received this transmission in error, please immediately notify us by telephone (collect) to arrange for return of the documents received and any copies made. Thank you.

#### MESSAGE:

In connection with the above-identified Patent Application, please find attached herewith the following documents:

- 1 page Transmittal Form;
- 1 page Fee Transmittal (in duplicate);
- 2 pages Transmittal Letter for Appeal Brief (in duplicate); and
- 24 pages Appeal Brief.

### PLEASE DELIVER THESE PAPERS TO:

**EXAMINER:** 

Phuong, Dai

GROUP ART UNIT:

2617

SERIAL NO.:

10/741,653

FILED:

December 19, 2003

INVENTOR:

WILLIAM H. ROBERTSON, JR

#### CERTIFICATE OF FAX TRANSMITTAL

I hereby certify that this correspondence is being facsimile to the United States Patent and Trademark Office, at (571) 273-8300 Centralized Patential, arkfressed to :Mail Stop: <u>APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS</u>. Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 on the date listed below:

Date: June 12, 2006

Printed Name: Larry G. Brown

## RECEIVED CENTRAL FAX CENTER No. 2658 P. 2

JUN 1 2 2006

	Application Number	10/741,653					
	Filing Date	December 19, 2003					
TRANSMITTAL	First Named Inventor	William H. Robertson, Jr.					
		2617					
FORM	Group Art Unit		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
(to be used for all correspondence after initial filling)  Total Number of Pages in this Submission 31		Phuong, Dai CE12083JME					
	ENCLOSURES		that apply)				
X Fee Transmittal Letter	Assignment Papers (for an Application)	After A	llowance				
Fee Attached	Drawing(s)	Appea	Communication to Group Appeal Communication to Board of Appeals and Interferences				
Amendment/Reply	Licensing-Related paper	s X Appea					
After Final	Petition	Proprietary Information					
Affidavits/Declaration(s)	Affidavits/Declaration(s) Petition to Convert to a Provisional Application						
Extension of time Request	Power of Attorney, Revoca Change of Correspondence	⊠ Tra	☐ Transmittal Letter for Brief on				
Express Abandonment Request	Address	Appeal					
Information Disclosure Statement	Terminal Disclaimer						
Certified Copy of Priority Documents	Request for Refund						
Response to Missing Parts/	CD, Number of CDs						
Incomplete Application	Remarks X Facsimile Transmittal						
Response to Missing Parts Under 37 CFR 1.52 or 1.53	. Tabsime Hansima						
	JRE OF APPLICANT, ATTORNEY	, OR AGENT					
Firm or Larry G. Brown		Registration No.	45,834				
Signature							
Date   June 12, 2006							
	RTIFICATE OF TRANSMITTAL/M	· ·	long site of with the 11-ine				
I hereby certify that this correspondence is being facsimile transmitted to facsimile number 571-273-8300 or deposited with the United States Postal Service with sufficient postage-thereon, as first-class mail, in an envelope addressed to:  Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313 on the date listed below:							
Typed or printed name   Larry G. Brown							
Signature	~	Date	June 12, 2006				

Jun 12 2006 2:00PM 9547233871

## **RECEIVED** CENTRAL FAX CENTER No. 2658 P. 3

## JUN 1 2 2006

		Complete If Known						
FEE Applica		Application N						
TRANSMITTAL Filing		Filing Date	e		Dcember 19, 2003			
Patent fees are subject to annual revision First Named		Invent	or	William H. Robertson, Jr.				
Applicant dalms small entity status	3. See 37 CFR 1.27	Examiner Na						
						·		
TOTAL AMOUNT OF PAYMENT	(\$) 500.00	Group Art U					<u> </u>	
TOTAL AMOUNT OF PATRICAT	(\$) 500.00	Attorney Doo	CKOT NO	).	CE12	4UE809	VIE	
METHOD OF PAYMEN	NT (check all that apply)		FEE CALCULATION (continued)					
Check Credit card Money Order Other None			3. ADDITIONAL FEES Large Small					
X Deposit Account				âty	<u>En</u>			
Deposit Account Number	502117		Fee	Fee	Fea	Fee		
Deposit Account Name	Motorola, Inc.		Code	(\$)	Code	(\$)	Fee Description	
The Director is authorized to: (check all that app	ph)	<del>_</del>	1051	130	2051	65	Surcharge - late filing lee or ceth	
X Charge tee(s) indicated below	X Credit arry over	erpayments	1052 1053	50 130	2052 1053	25 130	Surcharge - late Provisional Illing Non-English specification	
X Charge any additional lee(s) during	the pendency of this applicati	on	1812	2520	1812	2520	For filing a request for ex parte Responsibilities	
Charge fees(s) indicated below, except for the filing fee to the		1804	920'	1804	920*	Requesting publication of SIR prior to Examiner action		
above-identified deposit account.			1805	1840*	1805	1840*	Requesting publication of SIR after Examiner action	
FEE CALC	CULATION		1251	110	2251	55	Extension for reply within first month	
I EE OAE	JODANION		1252	430	2252	215	Extension for reply within second munth	
			1253	980	2253	490	Extension for reply within third month	
1. BASIC FILING FEE			1254	1530	2254	765	Extension for reply within tourith month	
			1255	2080	2255	1040	Extension for reply within fifth month	
Large Entity Small Entity Fee Fee Fee			1401 1402	340 340	2401 2402	170 170	Notice of Appeal Filing a brief in support of an appeal	500.00
Fee Fee Fee Fee Code (\$) Code (\$)	Fe	e Paid	1403	300	2403	150	Request for oral hearing Petition to institute a public use	
1001 790 2001 395	Utility filing fee		1451 1452	1510 110	1451 2452	1510 55	proceeding Pelition to revive – unavoldable	
1001 790 2001 395 1002 350 2002 175	Design filing fee		1453	1370	2453	685	Petition to revive - unintentional	
1003 550 2003 275	Plant tiling fee		1501	1370	2501	685	Utility issue fee (or reissue)	
1004 790 2004 395	Release filing fae		1502	490	2502	245	Design issue fee	
1005 160 2005 80	Provisional filing fee		1503 1460	660 130	2503 1460	330 130	Plant issue (ee Petitions to the Commissioner	<b></b>
	SUBTOTAL (1) (5) 0	<u>-</u>	1807	50	1807	50	Processing fee under 37 GFR 1.17(a)	
2. EXTRA CLAIM FEES			1806	180	1808	180	Submission of IDS	
Previously	Extra Fee from		8021	40	8021	40	Recording each patent assignment	
Total Claims Peid* - 20	= Claims Below 18	= Fee Paid	1809	790	2809	395	Per property (times number of properties) Filling a submission after final	
Independent Claims3	= X 88_	÷	1810	790	2810	395	rejection (37 CFR § 1.129(a)) For each additional invention to be	
Multiple Dependent	300	=					examined (37 CFR § 1.129(b))	
Large Entity Small Entity Fee Fee Fee Fee			1801	790	2801	<b>3</b> 95	Request for Continued Examination (RCE)	
Codc (5) Code (5)	Fee Descriptions in moses of 20	en .	1802	900	1502	900	Request for expedited examination of a design application	
1202 18 2202 9 Claims in excess of 20 1201 88 2201 44 Independent claims in excess of 3			Other lea	e (specity)			or a confer additional	
1203 300 2203 150 Multiple dependent claim, Il not paid [204 68 2204 44 Relissue independent claims over original patient					652			
	•							- 103
1205 18 2205 9 "Reissue claims in excess of 20 and over original Patent							.00	
SUBTOTAL (2) (5) 0		SUBTOTAL (3) (5) 500.00					.00	
"or number proviously paid, Il greater, For Reissues, see above				Reduced by Basic Fling Fee Paid				
SUBMITTED BY							Complete (il applicable)	702,4005
Name (PrinitType) Larry G. Brown Registration No. 45,834 Telephone 954-723-4295								
SUBTOTAL (2) (5) 0  "Or number previously paid. If greater, For Reissuss, see above."  SUBMITTED BY  Complete (if applicable)  Name (Print/Type)  Larry G. Brown  Reduced by Basic Fing Fee Paid  Telephone  954-723-4295  Signature  Date  June 12, 2006								

# CENTRAL FAX CENTER

No.2658 P. 5

## JUN 1 2 2006

#### UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

APPLICANT(S) William H. Robertson, Jr.

CONFIRMATION NO.:

3837

APPLN. NO.:

10/741,653

EXAMINER:

Phuong, Dai

FILED:

TITLE:

December 19, 2003

**GROUP ART UNIT:** 

2617

DOCKET NO.

**CE12083JME** 

LATCHING MECHANISM AND METHOD OF OPERATION

**THEREOF** 

CERTIFICATE OF FAX TRANSMITTAL

I hereby certify that this correspondence is being facsimile to the United States Patent and Trademark Office, at (571) 273-8300 Centralized Facsimile, addressed to: Mail Stop: APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS, Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450,

Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 on the date listed below: June 12, 2006 Date:

Signature:

Typed or Printed Name:

Larry Brown

## TRANSMITTAL LETTER FOR BRIEF ON APPEAL

Mail Stop: APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Sir:

Enclosed please find one copy of an Appeal Brief filed on behalf of the applicants in the matter of the above entitled application. This Brief is filed pursuant to 37 CFR § 1.192 and following the Final Rejection dated March 22, 2006 and the Notice of Appeal filed by Applicant on June 8, 2006.

06/13/2006 CNGUYEN2 00000044 502117 10741653

01 FC:1402

500.00 DA

Jun.12. 2006 2:01PM 9547233871 No.2658 P. 6

The Commissioner is authorized to charge the \$500.00 requisite fee for filing the enclosed Brief to Motorola, Inc., Deposit Account No. 502117. Any overpayment should be credit to the same Deposit Account.

Respectfully submitted,

SEND CORRESPONDENCE TO:

Motorola, Inc.

Customer Number: 24273

By: Larry G. Brown Attorney of Record

Reg. No. 45,834

Telephone: (954) 723-4295 Fax No.: (954) 723-3871

#### UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

APPLICANT(S) William H. Robertson, Jr.

**CONFIRMATION NO.:** 

3837

APPLN. NO.:

10/741,653

EXAMINER:

Phuong, Dai

FILED:

December 19, 2003

GROUP ART UNIT:

2617

DOCKET NO.

CE12083JME

TITLE:

LATCHING MECHANISM AND METHOD OF OPERATION

**THEREOF** 

#### CERTIFICATE OF FAX TRANSMITTAL

I hereby certify that this correspondence is being facsimile to the United States Patent and Trademark Office, at (571) 273-8300 Centralized Facsimile, addressed to: Mail Stop: APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS, Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 on the date listed below:

Date:

June 12, 2006

Signature: Typed or Printed Name:

Larry Brown

## TRANSMITTAL LETTER FOR BRIEF ON APPEAL

Mail Stop: APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

COPY

Sir:

Enclosed please find one copy of an Appeal Brief filed on behalf of the applicants in the matter of the above entitled application. This Brief is filed pursuant to 37 CFR § 1.192 and following the Final Rejection dated March 22, 2006 and the Notice of Appeal filed by Applicant on June 8, 2006.

The Commissioner is authorized to charge the \$500.00 requisite fee for filing the enclosed Brief to Motorola, Inc., Deposit Account No. 502117. Any overpayment should be credit to the same Deposit Account.

Respectfully submitted,

SEND CORRESPONDENCE TO:

Motorola, Inc.

Customer Number: 24273

By: La

Larry G. Brown Attorney of Record Reg. No. 45,834

Telephone: (954) 723-4295 Fax No.: (954) 723-3871



#### RECEIVED CENTRAL FAX CENTER

No.2658 P. 9

JUN 1 2 2006

Application No. 10/741,653 Appeal Brief dated June 12, 2006 CE12083JME

#### IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES

APPLIÇANT:

William H. Robertson, Jr.

ART UNIT:

2617

APPLN. NO.:

10/741,653

**EXAMINER:** Phuong, Dai

FILED:

December 19, 2003

TITLE:

LATCHING MECHANISM AND METHOD OF OPERATION THEREOF

#### CERTIFICATE OF FAX TRANSMITTAL

I hereby certify that this correspondence is being facsimile to the United States Patent and Trademark Office, at (571) 273-8300 Centralized Facsimile, addressed to: Mail Stop: APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS, Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 on the date listed

below:

Date:

Signature:

Typed or Printed Name:

Larry G. Brown

June 12, 2006

#### APPEAL BRIEF

Mail Stop: APPEAL BRIEF-PATENTS Commissioner for Patents P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Attention: Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences

Dear Chief Administrative Patent Judge:

This Appeal Brief is in furtherance of the Notice of Appeal transmitted via facsimile on June 8, 2006.

Page 1 of 24

CE12083JME

The fees required under 37 C.F.R. § 1.17(c) for filing this Appeal Brief have been authorized in the accompanying forms.

This brief is being transmitted by facsimile pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 1.6(d).

This brief contains items under the headings listed in the following Table of Contents, as set forth in 37 C.F.R. § 1.192(c).

CE12083JME

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

		Page
l.	Real Party in Interest	4
II.	Related Appeals and Interferences	4
III.	Status of Claims	4
IV.	Status of Amendments	4-5
V.	Summary of the Claimed Invention	5-7
VI.	Issues on Appeal	7-8
VII.	Grouping of Claims	8
VIII.	Argument	8-15
IX.	Claims Appendix	16-24

CE12083TME

#### I. **REAL PARTY IN INTEREST**

The real party of interest is Motorola, Inc., a Delaware corporation.

#### **RELATED APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES** II.

There are no related appeals or interferences.

#### STATUS OF CLAIMS III.

This is an appeal from the final rejection of claims 1-3 and 6-28 of the abovereferenced application.

#### TOTAL NUMBER OF CLAIMS IN APPLICATION A.

There are a total of 28 claims in the application.

#### В. STATUS OF ALL THE CLAIMS

Claims allowed: 1.

none

2. Claims objected to: 4 and 5

3. Claims rejected: 1-3 and 6-28

#### C. **CLAIMS ON APPEAL**

The claims on appeal are: 1-3 and 6-28.

#### IV. STATUS OF AMENDMENTS

A Final Rejection was mailed on March 22, 2006 in response to an Amendment filed on January 31, 2006. The Amendment and arguments were considered by the Examiner but were deemed unpersuasive and moot in view of

Page 4 of 24

CE12083JME

new grounds of rejection. Applicants faxed a Notice of Appeal on June 8, 2006.

This Appeal Brief is submitted in support of the Notice of Appeal.

#### V. SUMMARY OF THE CLAIMED INVENTION

Although specification citations are inserted below in accordance with C.F.R. 1.192(c), these reference numerals and citations are merely examples of where support may be found in the specification for the terms used in this section of the brief. There is no intention to in any way suggest that the terms of the claims are limited to the examples in the specification. Although, as demonstrated by the reference numerals and citations below, the claims are fully supported by the specification as required by law, it is improper under the law to read limitations from the specification into the claims. Pointing out specification support for the claim terminology, as is done here to comply with rule 1.192(c), does not in any way limit the scope of the claims to those examples from which they find support. Nor does this exercise provide a mechanism for circumventing the law precluding reading limitations into the claims from the specification. In short, the reference numerals and specification citations are not to be construed as claim limitations or in any way used to limit the scope of the claims.

The claimed subject matter pertains to a latching mechanism (105) for assembly of a housing (110) of an electronic device (100) and a method (500) of operating the mechanism (105). In particular, the latching mechanism (105) can

Page 5 of 24

CE12083TME

P. 14

include a latch element (120) and a receiving element (131) contained within the housing (110) (see FIGs. 1-4, page 4, lines 8-10 and page 5, lines 3-7). The receiving element (131) can include a recess (140) for engaging the latch element (120) and can include at least one audio port (122) for providing an audio channel (190) for the electronic device (100) (see FIGs. 1-4 and page 5, lines 15-16 and page 6, lines 1-4). In another arrangement, the latching mechanism (105) can include a secondary latch element (124) in which at least a portion of the housing (110) is mechanically coupled between the latch element (120) and the secondary latch element (124) (see FIGs. 1-4 and page 12, lines 21-23).

In another arrangement, the housing (110) can include a fixed housing portion (112, 113) and a removable housing portion (114) having the recess (140) and at least one audio port (122) that is part of the recess (140) (see FIGs. 1-4, page 4, lines 10-13 and page 6, lines 1-4). The latching mechanism (105) can be used to assemble the removable housing portion (114) to the fixed housing portion (112, 113) (see FIG. 5 (step 512) and page 14, lines 21-23). Moreover, the latch element (120) can be rotatably coupled to the removable housing portion (114), and the latch element (120) rotation can include an orientation for engaging the latch element (120) to assemble the removable housing portion (114) to the fixed housing portion (112, 113) (see FIGs. 1-4 and page 12, line 6 to page 13, line 6). Also in this arrangement, the audio port (122) is part of the audio channel (190),

Page 6 of 24

CE12083JME

and the audio channel (190) is formed when the removable housing portion (114) is assembled to the fixed housing portion (112, 113) (see FIG. 4 and page 13, lines 7-21).

In this embodiment, a gap (188) can be formed between the latch element (120) and the recess (131) when the removable housing portion (114) is assembled to the fixed housing portion (112, 113), and the audio channel (190) can include the gap (188) (see FIG. 4 and page 13, lines 16-20). Additionally, a keypad (116) can be assembled between the fixed housing portion (112, 113) and the removable housing portion (114) (see FIGs. 1 and 4 and page 6, lines 18-22).

#### VI. ISSUES ON APPEAL

Whether claims 1-3 and 6-13 are patentable under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) over U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2004/0203501 to Johnson, et al (Johnson) in view of U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2005/0014537 to Gammon, et al (Gammon).

Whether claims 14-17, 19-21 and 23-28 are patentable under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) over U.S. Patent No. 5,469,505 to Gattey, et al. (Gattey).

Whether claims 18 and 22 are patentable under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) over Gattey in view of Gammon.

#### VII. GROUPING OF CLAIMS

For purposes of this Appeal, the Applicants present the following grouping of

Page 7 of 24

#### claims:

- 1. Claims 1-3 and 6-13 are a group, with the appeal as to the ground of rejection being based on claim 1.
- 2. Claims 14-18 are part of another group, with the appeal as to the ground of rejection being based on claim 14.
- 3. Claims 19-28 are part of another group, with the appeal as to the ground of rejection being based on claim 19.

#### VIII. ARGUMENT

The recitations of Johnson, Gammon and Gattey do not render the invention of claims 1-3 and 6-28 unpatentable.

A brief summary of the Johnson, Gammon and Gattey references may be helpful. Johnson describes a mobile telephone (150) that includes an elongated housing (180), which includes a carabiner latch (154) pivotally attached at a battery door compartment (156) at the rear side of the housing (180) (see FiGs. 13-15 and paragraph 0041). Moreover, the latch (154) is adapted to be stored within a door recess (167) for receiving the latch (154) for storage purposes (see FiGs. 13-15 and paragraph 0043). The latch (154) can be swung outwardly away from the housing (180) to a variety of use positions (see FiGs. 13-15 and paragraph 0043). The latch (154) also has a hook portion that enables a user to attach the telephone to a suitable apparatus (see FiG. 15 and paragraph 0015). Johnson never

CE12083JME

mentions anything related to audio when discussing the latch (154), the door recess (167) or any other related structure.

Gammon discloses a mobile terminal that includes a housing (23), an electronic circuit (printed circuit board 182) and a speaker assembly (32) positioned in the housing (23) (see Abstract and paragraph 0053). The housing (23) includes an earpiece opening (442) (see FIG. 4 and paragraph 0065). Further, the speaker assembly (32) includes a first speaker (154) positioned adjacent a first side of the electronic circuit (182) and a second speaker (155) positioned adjacent the first speaker (154) on the first side of the electronic circuit (182) (see Abstract and FIG. 2). A grommet (184), which is positioned in the housing (23), is configured to receive the first speaker (154) and the second speaker (155), which are also positioned in the grommet (184) (see Abstract, paragraph 0054 and FIG. 2).

Gattey describes a communication headset 10 that includes a resilient headband (12) and a housing (14) adjustably connected to one end of the headband (12) (see FIG. 1 and col. 2, lines 63-67). It should be noted that the headset (10) of Gattey is expressly designed to be worn over the head of a user (see Abstract and col. 2, lines 8-11 and lines 63-65). The housing (14) includes a recess (36), and a hollow stem (38) having retaining barbs (40) that extends from the recess (36) of the housing (14) (see FIG. 4 and col. 3, lines 32-38). Additionally, a speaker shell (42) is pivotally and rotationally retained by the housing

Page 9 of 24

CE12083JME

(14) when a retaining clip (48) engages the retaining barbs (40) on the stem (38) and a thin spherical portion (44) of the shell (42) (see Fig. 4 and col. 3, lines 41-45). A speaker (60) is positioned in the shell (42), and speaker wires (64) electrically connect the speaker (60) to circuitry in the housing (14) by passing through the stem (38) (see Fig. 4 and col. 4, lines 5-13). Holes (67) are provided in the rear of the shell (42) to provide acoustic relief to the generally closed speaker enclosure (see Fig. 4 and col. 4, lines 14-16). Moreover, holes (66) of cover (56) are provided to acoustically couple the speaker (60) with the ear of the headset user (see Fig. 4 and col. 4, lines 13-14).

It is well settled that in order for a claim to be anticipated under 35 U.S.C. § 102, each and every element of the claimed invention must be disclosed in a single prior art reference. Orthokinetics, Inc. v. Safety Travel Chairs. Inc., 806 F.2d 1565, 1574 (Fed. Cir. 1986). Whether the reference discloses every element of the invention, and also whether the reference and the claimed invention are the same, is to be determined by considering how persons of ordinary skill in the art interpret the reference. Scripps Clink & Research Fdm. v. Genentech. Inc., 927 F.2d 1565, 1576 (Fed. Cir. 1991).

Additionally, the best defense against hind-sight based obviousness analysis is the rigorous application of the requirement for a showing of a teaching, or motivation to combine the prior art references. Ecolochem v. Southern California

Page 10 of 24

Edison Co., 227 F.3d 1361, 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2000). "Combining prior art references without evidence of such a suggestion, teaching or motivation simply takes the inventor's disclosure as a blueprint for piecing together the prior art to defeat patentability--the essence of hindsight." <u>Id</u>. at 1371-1372. There must also be some reasonable expectation of success for the suggested combination. <u>In re Dow</u> Chem. Co., 837 F.2d 469,473 (Fed. Cir. 1988).

Independent claim 1 recites the feature of a receiving element contained within the housing in which the receiving element includes a recess for engaging the latch element and at least one audio port for providing an audio channel for the electronic device. The Examiner has attempted to equate the door recess (167) of Johnson with the receiving element (131) of the present invention (see page 7 of the Final Office Action of March 22, 2006). Applicant respectfully disagrees with the Examiner's rejection that it would be obvious to one of skill in the art to modify the handset of Johnson with the earpiece port (442) of Gammon (it is believed that the Examiner is referring to earpiece port 442 as an audio port, as Applicant was unable to locate reference numeral 422 in the drawings).

In particular, Johnson is not at all concerned with the porting of audio in its discussion of the latch (154), the door recess (167) or any other related structure.

Johnson is directed to providing a latch that can permit a handset to be attached to a loop, strap or ring in an inverted manner (see Abstract). There is simply no

Page 11 of 24

CE12083JME

reason to desire to have a speaker and/or an audio channel positioned in the door recess (167) of Johnson. In fact, the terms "audio" and "acoustic" are completely absent from the Johnson reference. Moreover, even if such a configuration were attempted, the latch (154) itself would interfere with the proper passage of audio ernanating from the audio port. That is, when the latch (154) would be secured in the door recess (167), which more than likely would occur when the user is in a call, the latch (154) would block the flow of audio from the hypothetical port positioned in the door recess (167). The Johnson and Gammon references also do not present a solution as to how this obstacle could be overcome, and the Examiner is not permitted to rely on the structure in the present invention to do so (see In re Kuehl, 475 F.2d 658 (C.C.P.A. 1973). As such, Applicant submits that the Examiner's proposed combination does not present a reasonable expectation of success.

Independent claim 14 recites the element that the removable housing portion has a recess and at least one audio port in which the audio port is part of the recess and that the audio port is part of an audio channel formed when the removable housing portion is assembled to the fixed housing portion. Independent claim 19 recites similar features. Applicant submits that Gattey does not show, describe or even suggest such features. Specifically, Applicant notes that the Examiner has concluded that the speaker shell (42) of Gattey is equivalent to the removable housing portion (114) of the present invention and that the holes (67)

Page 12 of 24

CE12083JME

and/or the stem (38) of Gattey are equivalent to the audio port (122) of the present invention. It is clear from FIG. 4 that the stem (38) of Gattey is not part of the speaker shell (42), as it is actually part of the housing (14).

It is also clear that the holes (67) of Gattey are not part of an audio channel, as contemplated by the invention and as understood by one of skill in the art. The holes (67), in contrast, are merely for providing acoustic relief to the speaker enclosure. The audio channel in Gattey comprises the structure that is on the broadcast side of the speaker (60), particularly when one considers the statement that the "holes (66) are provided in cover (56) to acoustically couple speaker (60) with the ear of the headset user (see col. 4, lines 13-14). This principle also precludes the stem (38) from being considered an audio port, as that term would be understood by one of skill in the art. The stem (38) is simply designed to provide a passage for electrical wiring, not for porting audio.

Dependent claims 18 and 22 further recite the element that a keypad is assembled between the fixed housing portion and the removable housing portion. Applicant submits that there is simply no motivation to combine the keypad of Gammon with the headset of Gattey. Those of skill in the art realize that a headset is meant to be worn over the head of a user to allow the user to conduct hands-free voice conversations. Trying to implement a keypad into the headset of Gattey would defeat the hands-free nature of a headset and would be an inefficient use of

Page 13 of 24

CE12083JME

resources.

Based on the discussion above, Applicant submits that the Johnson,
Gammon and Gattey references simply do not show, describe or suggest, either
individually or in combination with one another, the claimed invention. As such,
Applicants believe that the rejections of independent claims 1, 14 and 19 are
improper and that these claims are patentable over the prior art. In addition,
Applicants submit that the claims that depend from these independent claims are
patentable over the prior art, both in view of their dependencies on the independent
claims and their own independent patentability.

#### Conclusion

For the claims to be unpatentable under § 102, each and every element of the claimed invention must be disclosed in a single prior art reference. Moreover, for claims to be unpatentable under § 103, there must be some suggestion or motivation to combine the prior art references, and the combination of references must show each and every element. Because every element of the claimed invention is not disclosed by the Gattey reference and because there is no suggestion to combine the Johnson and Gammon references, Applicant contends that the claims on appeal are patentable.

Page 14 of 24

CE12083JME

For the reasons set forth above, and as is apparent from a review of the above-cited references, the claims on appeal present patentable subject matter such that reversal of the rejection is appropriate.

Respectfully submitted,

Please send correspondence to:

Motorola, Inc.

Law Department - MD 1610

8000 W. Sunrise Blvd Plantation, FL 33322

Customer Number: 24273

Larry G. Brown

Bv:

June 12, 2006

Attorney for Applicants Registration No. 45,834 Tel. No.: (954) 723-6449

Fax No.: (954) 723-3871

E-Mail: lgbrown@motorola.com

CE12083JME

#### IX. CLAIMS APPENDIX

(original) A latching mechanism for assembly of a housing of an electronic device, comprising:

a latch element; and

a receiving element contained within the housing, wherein the receiving element comprises:

a recess for engaging the latch element, and

at least one audio port for providing an audio channel for the electronic device.

(original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 1, further comprising:

a gap formed between the latch element and the receiving element, wherein the audio channel further comprises the gap.

3. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 1, wherein the latch element is rotatably coupled to the recess, and further wherein the latch element rotation includes a first orientation for disengaging the latch element from the housing and a second orientation for engaging the latch element within the housing.

Page 16 of 24

CE12083JME

- 4. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 3, wherein the latch element comprises a protrusion, wherein the recess further comprises a similarly-shaped opening, and further wherein the protrusion aligns with the similarly-shaped opening in the second orientation.
- 5. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 4, wherein the protrusion misaligns with the similarly-shaped opening in the first orientation.
- 6. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 1, further comprising:

a secondary latch element, wherein at least a portion of the housing is mechanically coupled between the latch element and the secondary latch element, wherein the secondary latch element comprises at least one secondary latch element audio port aligned with the at least one audio port, and further wherein the audio channel further comprises the at least one secondary latch element audio port.

7. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 6, wherein the electronic device further comprises:

an audio element, wherein at least a portion of the secondary latch

CE12083JME

element is mechanically coupled between the audio element and at least a portion of the housing.

- 8. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 8, wherein the audio element generates an audio output, and further wherein the audio output is transmitted through the audio channel.
- 9. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 7, wherein the audio element receives an audio input through the audio channel.
- 10. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 6, wherein the secondary latch element comprises:
- an audio plate coupled between the latch element and at least a portion of the housing, wherein the audio plate includes at least one audio plate audio port, wherein the at least one secondary latch element audio port comprises the at least one audio plate audio port.
- 11. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 10, wherein the secondary latch element further comprises:
  - a seal coupled between the audio element and at least a portion of

CE12083JME

the housing, wherein the seal includes at least one seal audio port aligned with the at least one audio plate audio port, and wherein the at least one secondary latch element audio port further comprises the at least one seal audio port.

- 12. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 1, wherein the housing further comprises:
  - a fixed housing portion; and
- a removable housing portion, wherein the receiving element is contained within the removable housing portion, and further wherein the removable housing portion is assembled to the fixed housing portion when the latch element is engaged within the housing.
- 13. (original) The latching mechanism as defined in claim 12, wherein the electronic device further comprises a keypad, and further wherein the keypad is assembled between the fixed housing portion and the removable housing portion and the removable housing portion when the latch element is engaged within the housing.

CE12083JME

- 14. (previously presented) An electronic device, comprising:
  - a housing, comprising:
    - a fixed housing portion;
- a removable housing portion having a recess and at least one audio port, wherein the audio port is part of the recess;
- a latching mechanism for assembling the removable housing portion to the fixed housing portion, wherein the latch mechanism comprises:
- a latch element rotatably coupled to the removable housing portion, wherein the latch element rotation includes an orientation for engaging the latch element to assemble the removable housing portion to the fixed housing portion; and
- an audio channel, wherein the audio port is part of the audio channel and the audio channel is formed when the removable housing portion is assembled to the fixed housing portion.
- 15. (original) The electronic device as defined in claim 14, wherein the latch element rotation further includes another orientation for disengaging the latch element to disassemble the removable housing portion from the fixed housing portion.

CE12083JME

- 16. (previously presented) The electronic device as defined in claim 14, wherein a gap is formed between the latch element and the recess when the removable housing portion is assembled to the fixed housing portion, and further wherein the audio channel comprises the gap.
- 17. (original) The electronic device of claim 14, wherein the latching mechanism further comprises:

a secondary latch element, wherein the housing is mechanically coupled between the latch element and at least a portion of the secondary latch element, wherein the secondary latch element comprises at least one secondary latch element audio port aligned with the at least one audio port, and further wherein the audio channel further comprises the at least one secondary latch element audio port.

18. (original) The electronic device as defined in claim 14, a keypad, wherein the keypad is assembled between the fixed housing portion and the removable housing portion.

CE12083JME

19. (previously presented) A method of operating a latching mechanism, comprising the steps of:

mechanically coupling a latch element to a recess of a housing, wherein the recess includes at least one audio port;

creating an audio channel by engaging the latch element within the housing, wherein the audio ports are part of the audio channel; and porting audio through the audio ports of the audio channel.

- 20. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 19, wherein the mechanically coupling step includes forming a gap between the latch element and the housing, and further wherein the audio channel created in the creating step comprises the gap.
- 21. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 19, wherein engaging of the latch element within the housing comprises rotating the latch element to an orientation.
- 22. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 21, wherein the housing comprises a fixed housing portion mechanically to a removable housing portion, the method further comprising the step of:

CE12083JME

assembling a keypad between the fixed housing portion and the removable housing portion in response to the engaging of the latch element within the housing.

23. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 21, further comprising the step of:

disengaging the latch element from the housing by rotating the latch element to another orientation.

24. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 23, wherein the housing comprises a fixed housing portion mechanically to a removable housing portion, the method further comprising the step of:

disassembling the removable housing portion from the fixed housing portion in response to the disengaging step.

25. (previously presented) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 19, further comprising the step of:

mechanically coupling at least a portion of the housing between the latch element and at least a portion of a secondary latch element,

wherein the creating of the audio channel step further comprises

CE12083JME

aligning the audio ports of the housing with a secondary latch element audio ports of the secondary latch element.

26. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 25, further comprising the step of:

mechanically coupling an audio element to the secondary latch element.

27. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 26, further comprising the steps of:

generating an audio output by the audio element; and transmitting the audio output through the audio channel.

28. (original) The method of operating a latching mechanism as defined in claim 26, further comprising the steps of:

receiving an audio input; and

transferring the audio input to the audio element through the audio channel.

29. (canceled)

Page 24 of 24